## **Public Choice III**

DENNIS C. MUELLER

University of Vienna



## **Contents**

	Preface	page xv11
1	Introduction	1
	Part I Origins of the state	
2	The reason for collective choice – allocative efficiency	9
	2.1 Public goods and prisoners' dilemmas	9
	2.2 Coordination games	14
	2.3 Public goods and chickens	16
	2.4* Voluntary provision of public goods with constant returns to scale	18
	2.5* Voluntary provision of public goods with varying supply technologies	
	2.6 Externalities an analysis was to be the control of the control	25
	2.7 The Coase theorem	27
	2.8 Coase and the core	30
	2.9 A generalization of the Coase theorem	32
	2.10 Does the Coase theorem hold without predefined property rights?	34
	2.11 Externalities with large numbers of individuals	. 35
	2.12 Externalities with large numbers of individuals – a second time	39
	2.13 Experimental results in the voluntary provision of public goods	40
3	The reason for collective choice – redistribution	44
	3.1 Redistribution as insurance	45
	3.2 Redistribution as a public good	47
	3.3 Redistribution to satisfy fairness norms	49
	3.4 Redistribution to improve allocative efficiency	51
	3.5 Redistribution as taking	53
	3.6 Income transfers in the United States	56
	3.7 Redistribution and the distribution of income	58
	3.8 Redistribution to special interests	61
	Part II Public choice in a direct democracy	
4	The choice of voting rule	67
	4.1 The unanimity rule	67
	4.2 Criticisms of the unanimity rule	72
	4.3 The optimal majority	74
	4.4 A simple majority as the optimal majority	76

5	Majo	rity rule – positive properties	79
	5.1	Majority rule and redistribution	79
	5.2	Cycling	84
	5.3*	The median voter theorem – one-dimensional issues	85
	5.4	Majority rule and multidimensional issues	87
	5.5*	Proof of the median voter theorem – multidimensional case	92
	5.6	Majority rule equilibria when preferences are not defined in	
		spatial terms	94
	5.7*	Proof of extremal restriction – majority rule theorem	95
	5.8	Restrictions on preferences, on the nature and number of issues, and	
		on the choice of voting rule that can induce equilibria	97
	5.8	.1 Preference homogeneity	97
		.2 Homogeneous preferences and qualified majority rules	99
		.3 The relationship between numbers of issues and alternatives	
		and the required majority	103
	5.9	Logrolling	104
		Logrolling and cycling	108
	5.11	Testing for logrolling	109
	5.12	Agenda manipulation	112
	5.1	2.1 Agenda control in a spatial environment	112
		2.2 Agenda control in a divide-the-cake game	113
		Why so much stability?	114
		3.1 Issues are indeed of one dimension	115
	5.1	3.2 Voting one dimension at a time	116
		3.3 Logrolling equilibria	118
		3.4 Empirical evidence of cycling	120
		3.5 Experimental evidence of cycling	123
6		rity rule – normative properties	128
	6.1	Condorcet's jury theorem	128
	6.2	May's theorem on majority rule	133
	6.3*	Proof of May's theorem on majority rule	135
	6.4	The Rae-Taylor theorem on majority rule	136
	6.5	Assumptions underlying the unanimity rule	137
	6.6	Assumptions underlying the two rules contrasted	138
	6.7	The consequences of applying the rules to the "wrong" issues	140
		.1 Deciding improvements in allocative efficiency via majority rule	140
		.2 Deciding redistribution by unanimity	143
	6.8	Conclusions	144
7			
7		le alternatives to majority rule	147
	7.1	The alternative voting procedures defined	147
	7.2	The procedures compared – Condorcet efficiency	
	7.3	The procedures compared – utilitarian efficiency	151
	7.4	The Borda count	152
		.1 Axiomatic properties	152
		.2 The Borda count and the "tyranny of the majority"	154
		.3 The Borda count and strategic manipulation	155
	7.5	Approval voting	156
	7.6	Implications for electoral reform	157

Contents		ix
Contents		12

8	Complicated alternatives to majority rule	159
	8.1 The demand-revealing process	160
	8.1.1 The mechanics of the process	160
	8.1.2 Vernon Smith's auction mechanism	168
	8.2 Point voting	169
	8.3* An explication of the Hylland-Zeckhauser point-voting procedure	170
	8.4 Voting by veto	174
	8.5 A comparison of the procedures	179
9	Exit, voice, and disloyalty	182
	9.1 The theory of clubs	183
	9.2 Voting-with-the-feet	186
	9.3 Global optimality via voting-with-the-feet	189
	9.4* Clubs and the core	194
	9.5 Voting-with-the-feet: empirical evidence	199
	9.6 Voluntary association, allocational efficiency, and distributional	
	equity	202
	9.7 The theory of revolution	204
	Part III Public choice in a representative democracy	
10	Federalism	209
	10.1 The logic of federalism	209
	10.1.1 The assignment problem	209
	10.1.2 Federalism with geographic representation	212
	10.2 Why the size of government may be "too large" under federalism	213
	10.2.1 Logrolling	213
	10.2.2 Universalism	215
	10.3 Intergovernmental grants under federalism	215
	10.3.1 Intergovernmental grants to achieve Pareto optimality	216
	10.3.2 The empirical evidence on intergovernmental grants	221
	10.4 Why the size of government may be "too large" and "too small"	
	under federalism	223
	10.5 The problem of centralization under federalism	227
11	Two-party competition – deterministic voting	230
	11.1 Outcomes under two-party democracy	231
	11.2 Two-party competition in a constrained policy space	236
	11.2.1 The uncovered set	236
	11.2.2 The uncovered set with high valence issues	240
	11.3 Relaxing the assumptions of the Downsian model	241
	11.3.1 Candidates have preferences over policies	241
	11.3.2 Candidates can enter and exit the contests	242
	11.4 Testing the median voter hypothesis	243
	11.5 Are local public expenditures public or private goods?	246
12	Two-party competition – probabilistic voting	249
14	12.1 Instability with deterministic voting	249
	12.2 Equilibria under probabilistic voting	252
	12.3 Normative characteristics of the equilibria	253
	12.4 Equilibria with interest groups	255
	12.5 An application to taxation	257
	The state of the s	

	12.5.1 The logic	257
	12.5.2 The evidence	259
	12.6 Commentary	260
13	Multiparty systems	264
	13.1 Two views of representation	264
	13.2 Selecting a representative body of legislators	265
	13.3 Proportional representation in practice	266
	13.4 Electoral rules	266
	13.4.1 The Hare, Droop, Imperiali, d'Hondt, and Sainte-Lagué	
	formulas	267
	13.4.2 The single-transferable vote (STV)	269
	13.4.3 Limited voting	270
	13.4.4 Single-nontransferable-vote systems (SNTV)	271
	13.5 Electoral rules and the number of parties	271
	13.6 Electoral rules and the degree of proportionality	276
	13.7 The goals of parties	278
	13.7.1 Coalition theories with a one-dimensional issue space	280
	13.7.2 Coalition theories with two- or more-dimensional issue spaces	285
	13.7.2.1 The political heart	285
	13.7.2.2 The dimension-by-dimension median	286
	13.8 Cabinet stability	290
	13.8.1 The duration of governments	290
	13.8.2 The death of governments	292
	13.8.3 Summary	295
	13.9 Social stability	295
	13.10 Strategic voting	296
	13.10.1 Strategic voting under the plurality rule	296
	13.10.2 Strategic voting in multiparty systems	297
	13.11 Commentary	298
14	The paradox of voting	303
	14.1 The rational voter hypothesis	304
	14.1.1 Expected utility maximization	304
	14.1.2 A taste for voting	306
	14.1.3 Voting as a game of cat and mouse	306
	14.1.4 The rational voter as minimax-regret strategist	307
	14.2 The rational voter hypothesis: the evidence	308
	14.3 The expressive voter hypothesis	320
	14.4 The ethical voter hypothesis	322
	14.5 Ethical preferences as selfish behavior	325
	14.6 The selfish voter	326
	14.7 Summary and implications	329
15	Rent seeking	333
	15.1 The theory of rent seeking	333
	15.1.1 The basic rent-seeking model with a fixed number of players	335
	15.1.1.1 Diminishing or constant returns, $r \leq 1$	336
	15.1.1.2 Increasing returns with $1 < r \le 2$	336
	15.1.1.3 Increasing returns with $r > 2$	337

Contents	xi
Contents	

	15.1.2 The impact of free entry	337
	15.1.3 Rent seeking with sequential investments	338
	15.1.4 Relaxing the assumptions	340
	15.1.4.1 Risk-neutrality	340
	15.1.4.2 Rent seeking among groups	342
	15.1.4.3 Rent seeking when the probability of winning is	
	not defined logistically	342
	15.1.4.4 Designing rent-seeking contests	342
	15.2 Rent seeking through regulation	343
	15.3 Rent seeking and the political process	347
	15.4 Rent seeking through tariffs and quotas	348
	15.4.1 The economic effects of tariffs, quotas, and voluntary	
	export restraints	348
	15.4.2 Endogenous protection models	350
	15.4.3 Remaining puzzles	353
	15.5 Rent seeking in other governmental activities	354
	15.6 How large are the welfare losses from rent seeking?	355
16		359
16	Bureaucracy 16.1 Uncertainty, information, and power	360
	16.2 The budget-maximizing bureaucrat	362
	16.2.1 Environment and incentives	362
	16.2.2 The model	363
	16.3 Extensions of the model	365
	16.3.1 Alternative institutional assumptions	365
	16.3.2 Bargaining between sponsor and bureau	368
	16.4 Alternative behavioral assumptions	368
	16.4.1 The slack-maximizing bureaucrat	368
	16.4.2 The risk-avoiding bureaucrat	370
	16.5 Empirical tests	371
	16.5.1 Power of the agenda setter	371
	16.5.2 Cost differences between publicly and privately provided	
	services	373
	16.6 The government as Leviathan	380
	16.6.1 Theory	380
	16.6.2 Empirical testing – government expenditures and taxes	382
	16.7 Conclusions	384
17	Legislatures and bureaucracies	386
	17.1 The Congressional-dominance model	386
	17.1.1 Congressional dominance through administrative structure	386
	17.1.2 Congressional dominance through administrative procedure	388
	17.2 The impact of uncertainty and transaction costs	388
	17.2.1 Uncertainty and the locus of responsibility	389
	17.2.2 Uncertainty, transaction costs, and commitment	389
	17.3 Congress and the president	391
	17.3.1 The legislature controls the president	391
	17.3.2 Presidential control over the legislature	393
	17.3.3 The problem of deadlocks	395

	17.4 Congress, the president, and the judiciary	399
	17.4.1 Adding the judiciary to the model	399
	17.4.2 The goals of the judiciary	399
	17.5 Legislative decision making in the European Union	401
	17.6 Conclusions	405
18	Dictatorship	406
	18.1 The origins of dictatorship	407
	18.2 The goals of dictators	409
	18.2.1 The consumption of the dictator	409
	18.2.2 Power	411
	18.2.3 Security	411
	18.3 The functioning and survival of dictatorships	412
	18.3.1 The utility-maximizing dictator	412
	18.3.2 Tin pots and totalitarians	413
	18.3.3 Selective strategies to survive	414
	18.3.4 The dictator's dilemma	416
	18.3.5 The limits of totalitarianism	417
	18.4 The rise and decline of dictatorships	417
	18.5 Dictatorship and economic performance	420
	18.5.1 The relative advantages of dictatorship and democracy	420
	18.5.2 The relative economic performance of dictatorships	
	and democracies	422
	18.5.2.1 A direct test of Wintrobe's model of dictatorship	424
	18.6 Conclusions	424
	Part IV Applications and testing	
19	Political competition and macroeconomic performance	429
1)	19.1 Macroeconomic performance and political success	429
	19.1.1 Vote and popularity functions	429
	19.1.2 Whom do voters hold responsible?	433
	19.2 Opportunistic politics	437
	19.2.1 With myopic voters	438
	19.2.2 With rational voters	439
	19.3 Partisan politics	440
	19.3.1 Partisan politics with retrospective voters	443
	19.3.2 Partisan politics with rational, forward-looking voters	444
	19.4 The evidence	446
	19.4.1 Do politicians try to manipulate the macroeconomic	
	environment?	116
	19.4.2 Are there partisan biases?	447
	19.4.3 Which theories fit the data best?	
	19.4.4 Additional evidence for the Alesina/Rosenthal model	455
	19.4.5 Discussion	456
	19.5 Voter-behavior	459
	19.5.1 Myopic, retrospective, rational	
	19.5.2 Sociotropic or egotropic	460
	19.6 Politics and inflation	461
	17.0 I OHIO MIG HIHAHOH	101

	Contents	xiii
	19.6.1 Hypotheses	461
	19.6.2 The facts	462
	19.6.3 Central bank independence	465
	19.7 Deficits	466
	19.7.1 The facts	466 466
	19.7.2 Hypotheses	
	19.7.2.1 Fiscal illusion and Keynesian delusions	466
	19.7.2.2 Political business cycles	467
	19.7.2.3 Partisan effects	467
	19.7.2.4 Government paralysis	467
	19.7.2.5 Budgetary rules	468
	19.7.3 The evidence	468
	19.8 Reflections	469
20	Interest groups, campaign contributions, and lobbying	472
	20.1 The logic of collective action	473
	20.2 Models of interest group behavior in politics	475
	20.2.1 Informative campaigning in a Downsian model	476 477
	20.2.2 Persuasive campaigning in a Downsian model	4//
	20.3 Empirical studies of the causes and consequences of	481
	campaign contributions 20.3.1 Votes for a candidate are a function of campaign expenditures	481
	20.3.2 Determinants of campaign contributions	486
	20.3.3 Determinants of representative voting behavior – campaign contributions	489
	20.3.4 Determinants of representative voting behavior – ideology or pure survival	489
	20.3.5 Evaluation	493
	20.4 Lobbying	496
	20.5 The welfare effects of interest group activities	497
21	The size of government	501
21	21.1 The facts	501
	21.2 Explanations for the size and growth of government	506
	21.2.1 The government as provider of public goods and eliminator of externalities	506
	21.2.1.1 "Taste variables"	507
	21.2.1.1 Taste variables 21.2.1.2 Income	509
	21.2.1.3 The Baumol effect	510
	21.2.1.3 The Baumor effect 21.2.2 The government as redistributor of income and wealth	511
	21.2.2.1 The Meltzer and Richard model	512
	21.2.2.2 Additional redistribution—growth-of-government hypotheses	514
	21.2.2.3 Some logical/empirical difficulties with the redistribution—	511
	growth-of-government hypothesis	515
		313
	21.2.2.4 Direct empirical tests of the redistribution–government-size	516
	hypothesis 21.2.3 Interest groups and the growth of government	519
	21.2.4 Bureaucracy and the growth of government	523
	with the state of	

	~
X1V	Contents

	21.2.5 Fiscal illusion	527
	21.2.6 Tax elasticity	529
	21.3 Conclusions	530
22	Government size and economic performance	535
	22.1 The welfare losses from taxation	536
	22.2 Government size and black market activity	539
	22.3 Government size and corruption	544
	22.4 Government size and economic productivity	545
	22.5 Government size and economic growth	548
	22.5.1 Methodological issues	548
	22.5.2 The evidence	551
	22.6 Government activity and the economic decline of nations	554
	22.6.1 The logic	554
	22.6.2 Empirical evidence	556
	22.7 Conclusions	559
	22.7 Conclusions	337
	Part V Normative public choice	
23	Social welfare functions	563
	23.1 The Bergson-Samuelson social welfare function	563
	23.2 Axiomatic social welfare functions	568
	23.2.1 Fleming's social welfare function	568
	23.2.2 Harsanyi's social welfare function	569
	23.2.3 Two criticisms of Harsanyi's social welfare function	571
	23.2.3.1 Should individual attitudes toward risk count?	571
	23.2.3.2 Can individuals agree on a value for <i>W</i> ?	572
	23.2.4 Ng's social welfare function	575
	_	
	23.2.5 Nash's and other multiplicative social welfare functions 23.3 What form of social welfare function is best?	576
		578
24	The impossibility of a social ordering	582
	24.1 Logic of the proof	583
	24.2 Relaxing the postulates	585
	24.2.1 Transitivity	586
	24.2.2 Unrestricted domain	589
	24.2.3 Independence of irrelevant alternatives	590
	24.3 Strategy-proof social welfare functions	592
	24.4 Implications for public choice	595
25	A just social contract	597
	25.1 The social contract	598
	25.2 The two principles of justice	599
	25.3 Extensions of the theory to other political stages	602
	25.4 Critique of the Rawlsian social contract	603
	25.4.1 The social contract	603
	25.4.2 The two principles of justice	607
	25.4.3 Experimental evidence	609
	25.5 Two utilitarian defenses of the maximin principle	609
	25.5.1 Maximin as a means to obtain compliance	609
	25.5.2 Maximin as a redistribution principle	611
	25.6 The social contract as a constitution	612

Contents	XV
----------	----

26	The constitution as a utilitarian contract	615
	26.1 The constitutional context	616
	26.2 The two-action case	617
	26.3 The constitutional contract	619
	26.3.1 Optimal collective action with only identity uncertainty	620
	26.3.2 Optimal collective action with identity and numbers uncertainty 26.3.3 Optimal collective action with identity, numbers, and	622
	payoff uncertainty	624
	26.4 Symmetric and asymmetric bans and obligations	624
	26.5 Continuous actions with interdependent utilities	625
	26.6 Decision-making costs	627
	26.6.1 Prisoners' dilemmas	628
	26.6.2 Direct conflicts	631
	26.7 Rights and obligations	631
	26.8 Constitutions: contracts or conventions?	634
	26.8.1 Constitutions as contracts	634
	26.8.2 Constitutions as conventions	636
	26.8.3 Discussion	637
	26.9 Conclusions regarding two-stage theories of social choice	639
	26.10 From the normative, two-stage theory of constitutions to	
	hypothesis testing	640
27	Liberal rights and social choices	643
21	27.1 The theorem	643
	27.2 Resolving the paradox	644
	27.2.1 Rights over Pareto	644
	27.2.2 Pareto trades of actions	646
	27.2.3 Pareto trades of rights	648
	27.3 Rights over social states versus rights over actions	650
	27.4 Liberal rights and obligations	651
	27.5 Constitutional rights and liberal rights	652
	Part VI What have we learned?	
28	Has public choice contributed anything to the study of politics?	657
20	28.1 The failures of rational actor models of politics	658
	28.2 The rational choice approach to modeling	659
	28.3 The prediction of cycling	662
	28.4 The predictions of spatial models	663
	28.5 Predicting voting and free-riding	666
	28.6 Can public choice contribute to the positive study of	
	political institutions?	668
	28.7 Has public choice contributed anything to the normative study	
	of political institutions?	670
	28.8 Conclusions	671
29	Allocation, redistribution, and public choice	675
	References	683
	Name index	749
	Subject index	763